Health, Resilience and Sustainable Poverty Escapes

Speakers:
- Christine Gottschalk, USAID Center for Resilience
- Tiffany Griffin, USAID Center for Resilience
- Vidya Diwakar, Chronic Poverty Advisory Network
- Andrew Shepherd, Chronic Poverty Advisory Network
- Lynn Michalopoulos, USAID Consultant

Moderator: Julie MacCartee

Date: November 28, 2018
Tiffany Griffin leads the resilience measurement, monitoring, evaluation and analysis work for the USAID Center for Resilience. Previously, she was manager for impact and learning for the Democracy Fund, a private foundation in Washington, D.C., as well as a monitoring and evaluation specialist at USAID supporting the Feed the Future initiative. Using mixed-methods approaches and systems modeling, Tiffany has applied research techniques typically confined to the lab to complex real-world contexts. Prior to her food security work at USAID, Tiffany worked in the U.S. Senate on domestic health policy as well as on domestic food and nutrition policy. Tiffany Griffin received her doctorate in Social Psychology from the University of Michigan and has Bachelors of Arts degrees in Psychology and Communications from Boston College.
Vidya Diwakar, Chronic Poverty Advisory Network

Vidya is a mixed-methods researcher at the Chronic Poverty Advisory Network, specializing in gender-disaggregated analysis of poverty dynamics, conflict and education. She has particular experience in South Asia but has also led various policy-oriented research projects on poverty dynamics in sub-Saharan Africa and East Asia.
Andrew Shepherd, Chronic Poverty Advisory Network

Andrew has been with CPAN since its inception in 2011, and with the ODI, where CPAN is now hosted, since 2002. He has three decades of work on poverty, having led the production of three Chronic Poverty Reports – and with the next report forthcoming. He previously directed the Chronic Poverty Research Centre, and has worked for UNICEF in Sudan and as senior lecturer at Birmingham University. His major developing country experience has been in Ghana, India, Sudan, Tanzania, Kenya and Uganda.
Dr. Lynn Michalopoulos is currently working as a consultant with the USAID Center for Resilience, providing expertise and technical support related to resilience measurement and analysis, especially as it relates to psychosocial factors. Dr. Michalopoulos is also currently an Associate Professor at Columbia School of Social Work. Her research focuses on how trauma outcomes vary across cultural and contextual contexts, especially among non-Western low and middle income countries. Dr. Michalopoulos has conducted extensive research in Zambia, Uganda and South Africa where she has provided technical support and expertise related to the integration of psychosocial measures and evidence-based mental health interventions into programming.
Overview of Presentation

Context, methods, and motivation
- The context: getting to zero extreme poverty
- Q-squared research
- Poverty trajectories across countries

General findings across country studies
- Endowments, resources, assets
- Conversion factors and enabling context
- Shocks and stressors

Health, resilience, and sustainable poverty escapes
- Findings: health shocks, barriers, coping strategies
- Implications: health insurance, quality and coverage, expanding support for ill health, critical links
Health and Resilience Conceptual Framework

1. Health shocks
2. Health as a capacity
3. Health as an outcome to be sustained
TOP TAKE-AWAYS
Overall and health-specific findings

1. Sustained escapes vary in prevalence across countries

2. **Agriculture** remains important amidst decreasing land size and incomes

3. Adverse gender- and other **social norms** can prolong chronic poverty

4. **Conflict-climate** nexus associated with high rates of impoverishment

5. Health shocks in **sequence** propel poverty descents

6. Coping strategies to ill health vary in absence of health insurance

7. Health insurance, quality services, and links critical
Context, Methods and Motivation
The Context: Building Resilience to get to Zero Poverty

**Income sources** from livelihoods, non-market production or in-kind transfers can lead to...

- **Individuals accruing tangible and intangible assets**, which...

- **With beneficial conversion factors** can sustain escapes from poverty.


Source: Diwakar and Shepherd (2018)
Mixed Methods for Poverty Dynamics

Drivers, causality, combination
Magnitude, associations
Pathways and process

Macro
Structural
Institutions
Community
Household
Indiv.

Policy options
Policy gaps
Evaluations

Poverty dynamics across Contextualised levels of analysis
Poverty Dynamics in Africa and Asia
Using national poverty lines

*Note: Niger, Malawi, and Rwanda have only two waves, and so examines poverty escapes instead of “sustained” escapes over a longer period of time. Rates of impoverished and chronic poor in Tanzania are particularly low on account of an effectively low national poverty line in the panel dataset.*
Key Findings

Tanzania, Malawi, Ethiopia, Rwanda, Niger, Uganda, rural Kenya, Philippines, Nepal, rural Bangladesh, rural Cambodia
Key Findings: Endowments and Resources

Agriculture is important amidst decreasing land size and incomes

Rural Kenya, 2000-2010

Rural Cambodia, 2008-2017

% of income

Hectares

- Chronic poor
- Impoverished
- Transitory escapers
- Sustained escapers
- Never poor

- Acres owned 2004
- Acres owned 2007
- Acres owned 2010

Other income
- Donation
- Wage
- Remittance
- Non-farm
- Livestock
- Livestock
- Crop

MARKETLINKS

AGRICULTURAL DEVELOPMENT PROJECT
Key Findings: Conversion Factors
Adverse social norms prolong chronic poverty

“People start treating you with respect once your economic status improves... but if your economic status is poor then people start ignoring you... I have seen other people being discriminated just because of their poor economic status”
(Ketan, Dailekh, Nepal)
Key Findings: Shocks and Stressors
Changing climate conditions linked to conflict

“...The conflict between pastoralists and farmers escalated into a big fight... her farm was set on fire, all crops were burned, same as for the farm house, the food reserve, and all household belongings... Tabu lost everything” (Tabu, Dodoma, Tanzania)
Big Picture Policy Implications
A note on impoverishment ratios

- Transitory escapers and impoverished : Sustained escapers (ratio)
- Transitory escapers : Sustained escapers (ratio)
Big Picture Policy Implications

- Sustained escapes are commonly produced by combinations of factors
- Female-headed households constrained yet still exert agency
- Policies need to address the major reasons for transitory escapes: this means improving existing policies and innovating
- Generally neglected policy areas require new focus with context specificity
Health, Resilience and Sustainable Poverty Escapes

Key findings and policy and programming implications

Tanzania, Malawi, Ethiopia, Rwanda, Niger, Uganda, rural Kenya, Philippines, Nepal, rural Bangladesh, rural Cambodia
Multiplier Effects and Sequences

Key finding 1/3

MUSTAPHA
Born 1977
Urban Zinder, Niger


Well-being

Poverty line

- Born
- Sells vegetables with brother
- Migrates to Nigeria, becomes marriage photographer, returns home
- Receives government assistance
- Married, re-migrates to Nigeria
- Marriage business suffers as more people have smartphones
- Ill health of children, one dies
Multiplier Effects and Sequences

Key finding 1/3

RAFIQUL
Born 1964
 Jessore District, Bangladesh


- Born
- Starts working as an agricultural labourer and drops out of school
- Father is sick and can’t work
- Sells cattle and takes land lease
- As eldest child, supports siblings
- Takes loan for daughter’s wedding
- Gets married, receives cattle from father-in-law
- Accumulates wealth through day labour and farming
- Day labour, cultivates land. With brother pays wedding costs of 6 sisters
- Wife sick
- Rafiql sick
- Failed bribe for son to get a job

Well-being
Barriers to Healthcare
Key finding 2/3

- Health insurance coverage
- Quality of health services
- High opportunity costs, user costs

Stella mentioned that a key benefit of being married was that her husband paid for private medical care which was closer to her house. This was especially important in the rainy season:

‘During the rainy seasons the roads became impassable and so if her child was sick instead of going to free hospital (2-3km) she was able to have the money to go to the private clinic which was closer to her house - walkable distance.”

Source: LHI with Stella (F, 40 years old, transitory escaper) in rural Malawi
Coping Strategies for Health Shocks
Key finding 3/3

- Health insurance
- Relying on savings
- Selling assets such as livestock
- Support from social networks
- Loans from informal moneylenders

Meas (sustained escaper, rural Cambodia) had surgery for a tumor on her spine in 2018, costing USD 5-6,000. She drew down on savings, borrowed from family and USD2,000 from AMK microfinance, and USD1,000 from her husband’s employer
Coping Strategies for Health Shocks
Key finding 3/3

- Health insurance
- Relying on savings
- Selling assets such as livestock
- Support from social networks
- Loans from informal moneylenders

Redo (rural Ethiopia): “When the doctor referred my mentally-ill daughter to a big hospital in Addis Ababa, I had to spend Birr 11,000. Then my son got sick and I had to spend Birr 7,000 for medication. I had to sell my only ox to cover these expenses.”
Coping Strategies for Health Shocks
Key finding 3/3

- Health insurance
- Relying on savings
- Selling assets such as livestock
- Support from social networks
- Loans from informal moneylenders

In 2017, Dindo began to suffer from severe stomach pains. He became immobilized and was hospitalized for treatment of stomach cancer. Dindo has been staying at home this year and has stopped driving his tricycle. His wife, mother and two sisters now take care of him. His mother, who used to work in rice fields, stopped work because of worsening rheumatism.

Dindo’s family meet subsistence needs through provisions by his brother, and his two sisters’ husbands who work in Legaspi city on minimum wage salaries. But the family is unable to raise money for treatments and has foregone a number of scheduled appointments and medications due to lack of funds. -- LHI with Dindo (M, transitory escaper), rural Philippines
No One-Size-Fits-All Policy Context
Implications 1/4

Rwanda
• **Compulsion**: required health insurance premiums for all but poorest two segments
• Improving quality of public health **services**
• **Public works** which cushion shocks for the very poor
• **But**: targeting errors; financial sustainability

Kenya
• 2010 constitution and **devolution** of power
• Counties where **governors active** in promoting health services
• Several counties **upgraded health facilities**
• **But**: Wide variations; health budget may not reach hospitals
Universal Health Insurance
Implications 2/4

- Developing a new health insurance program
- Expand health insurance to more effectively provide safety nets
- Financing health insurance for the poor

Domestic general government health expenditure (% of GDP)
Universal Health Insurance
Implications 2/4

• Developing a new health insurance program
• Expand health insurance to more effectively provide safety nets
• Financing health insurance for the poor

Tanzania’s Community Health Funds was designed partly to increase local revenue for health and improve the quality of health services through empowering local communities. Its income stems from member contributions matched by central government grants. However, lack of clear guidelines for its implementation has created variations in CHF schemes. In some areas, local authorities relied on private companies or NGOs for one-time support.

Tanzania’s new Health Financing Strategy is expected to improve health sector outcomes and help advance health coverage for the poor. Its core reform is in creating a mandatory Single National Health Insurance for all citizens, financed through cross-subsidization between the rich and poor. Its explicit objective is to establish a pro-poor financing mechanism.

Source: Wang and Rosemberg, 2018, unless stated otherwise
Improving Health Systems
Implications 3/4

- Expand coverage of health services
- Improve quality of healthcare

In a study in Cambodia, ‘three configurations of HEF were examined for their ability to attract beneficiaries to initiate care at public health facilities and their degree of financial risk protection:
- HEF covering only hospital services
- HEF covering health centre and hospital services
- Integrated Social Health Protection Scheme (iSHPS) that allowed non-HEFB community members to enroll in HEF. The iSHPS also used vouchers for selected health services, pay-for-performance for quantity and quality of care, and interventions aimed at increasing health providers’ degree of accountability.’

Source: Jacobs et al., 2018, in Shepherd, 2018
Expanding Support
Implications 4/4

Different forms of ill health
• Chronic illnesses
• Alcoholism
• Reproductive health
• Mental-health problems

Malawi, Niger, Rwanda, and Uganda comparison:
1) Rwanda and Malawi-dramatic fall in maternal mortality ratios since 2000
2) Uganda experienced just a small decrease
3) Improvement in Niger was almost negligible.
Expanding Support
Implications 4/4

Different forms of ill health
- **Chronic** illnesses
- **Alcoholism**
- **Reproductive** health
- **Mental** health problems

*Example: Interventions to break the cycle of poverty and mental ill health in Uganda: Mental Health and Poverty Project*
Example: Linking Community Based Health Insurance with the Productive Safety Net Program in Ethiopia

‘Individuals covered by both programs, as opposed to neither, are 5 percentage points more likely to use outpatient care, … 21 percentage points more likely to participate in off-farm work, … and participation in both programs is associated with a 5 percent increase in livestock, the main household asset, and a 27 percent decline in debt’ (Shigute et al, 2017)
TOP TAKE-AWAYS

Overall and health-specific findings

1. Sustained escapes vary in prevalence across countries

2. Agriculture remains important amidst decreasing land size and incomes

3. Adverse gender- and other social norms can prolong chronic poverty

4. Conflict-climate nexus associated with high rates of impoverishment

5. Health shocks in sequence propel poverty descents

6. Coping strategies to ill health vary in absence of health insurance

7. Health insurance, quality services, and links critical
Questions and Answers
Contact:

Julie MacCartee jmaccartee@usaid.gov for Agrilinks-related questions

Scott Fontaine sfontaine@usaid.gov for Marketlinks-related questions

Comment on today’s topic:  
Agrilinks or Marketlinks
# Annex

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Country report</th>
<th>Panel data (years/households)</th>
<th>Qualitative data (sample/date)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rural/urban</td>
<td>Source</td>
<td>Dataset and years</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Woldehanna et al., 2018</td>
<td></td>
<td>3388</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rwanda</td>
<td>Da Corta et al., 2018</td>
<td>Enquête Intégrale sur les Conditions de Vie des ménages: 2010, 2014</td>
<td>1920</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>