

STRENGTHENING PRIVATE SECTOR EXTENSION AND ADVISORY SERVICES

CHAT TRANSCRIPT

SEPTEMBER 11, 2019

PRESENTERS

Kristin Davis, International Food Policy Research Institute (IFPRI)

Robert Anyang, Chemonics International Inc.

Jean-Michel Voisard, RTI International

MODERATOR

Julie MacCartee, USAID Bureau for Food Security

Adam Ahmed: Hi Everyone, thank you for joining us here today. We will start in about 20 minutes

Erna Abidin: Good. Thanks, Mr. Adam. My name is Erna Abidin. I can hear the music now

Kristin Davis: Good day, everyone! This is Kristin Davis, one of the presenters.

Modibo G Coulibaly: Hi everyone, I am Biton from FOSCAR-Mali

Erna Abidin: I am from Kumasi, Ghana. Good day everybody

Danilo Saavedra: Good morning all from Nicaragua

HENRY PHIRI: I am Henry from Dwangwa, Malawi. Good day to you all.

Zachary Baquet: Greetings All! Zachary Baquet with USAID Bureau for Food Security and joining from DC.

Zachary Baquet: Welcome Everyone! As you join, let us know who you are and where you are joining from.

Zachary Baquet: Please take a moment to fill out the polls to the left.

Julie MacCartee: Good morning and welcome! We are getting set up in our webinar control room. Please feel free to introduce yourselves!

Pamela Robinson: Hello Everyone, I'm Pamela Robinson, joining from Atlanta GA

Zachary Baquet: Hi Pamela! Thank you for joining today.

Adulation Ndlovu: Greetings everyone, Adulation Ndlovu, Joining from Zimbabwe

Gary Alex: Good day to all. I am Gary Alex joining from Virginia, USA.

EKANATH Khatiwada: Hi

Zachary Baquet: Hi Gary! How are you?

Jean de Dieu Mugesera: Hello every one. this is Jean de Dieu MUGESERA, from Rwanda

Zachary Baquet: Greetings Adulation!

elon Gilbert: Joining from Arlee MT

Maria Briones: , I am Maria Auxiliadora Briones from NicaraguaHello

Cindy Arnevik: Good Morning to all. I am Cindy Arne

Danilo Saavedra: Hello everyone, my name is Danilo Saavedra from FUNICA, Nicaragua

Kristin Davis: Hi Maria Auxiliadora and Danilo!

Maria Briones: Hi Kristin

Lasha Avaliani: Hello. this is Lasha from Georgia

Zachary Baquet: Welcome Jean, Gilbert, and Maria!

Adam Ahmed: Hi Modibo!

Danilo Saavedra: Hi, Kristin is good hear of you

Diana Carolina Giraldo: Hi Everyone! I am Diana Giraldo from Colombia, joining from UK

Zachary Baquet: Hello Lasha!

Christina Hannum: Good morning! This is Christy from RTI.

Modibo G Coulibaly: Please how to makes links with your colleagues in Mali?

Zachary Baquet: Thanks for joining Diana!

Zachary Baquet: Hi Christy!

Nigel Sonariwo: Hi Everyone, Nigel Sonariwo, in Washington DC

Judy Payne: This is Judy Payne. Greetings to all.

Patrick McBride: yes

Diana Carolina Giraldo: Yes

Christina Hannum: yes, I can hear

HENRY PHIRI: Loud and clear!

Paul Guenette: Paul Guenette in Washington DC. Ahoy! Voice coming in now!

Caitlin Holder: Yes

elon Gilbert:yes

Zachary Baquet: Welcome Nigel!

Pamela Robinson: yes

Lamia Shendi: YES

Titus Echima Lendi: Hello every one

Julian Peach: Hi. This is Julian Peach connecting from Malaysia.

AV Tech: Thanks to all our presenters joining us from around the globe! Senegal, South Africa, and Uganda.

AV Tech: Because we have presenters in different locations around the globe, please bear with us should there be any lag or technical issues.

Titus Echima Lendi: This is Titus from Uganda, East Africa

Zachary Baquet: Welcome Titus and Julian!

Lamia Shendi: Hi , Am Lamia , USAID mission Sudan - FFP

AV Tech: If you have questions or are encountering any issues, hover your mouse over my name ("AV Tecj

Zachary Baquet: Thank you for joining us today Lamia!

AV Tech: "AV Tech" and ask the question, I will troubleshoot with you. Thanks

Modibo G Coulibaly: AV Tech, our issue is to know how to makes contact with your team in Mali ?

Chamroeun Hinn: Hi, Am Chamroeun Hinn, harvest 2, Cambodia

Modibo G Coulibaly: USAID program

Martin Banda: Martin Banda joining from Malawi Mission

Nacasi Green: Is there a call in number?

AV Tech: <https://www.usaid.gov/mali>

Zachary Baquet: Hello Chamroeun and Martin!

Raed Nimri : Hi this is Raed Nimri DCOP - Jordan Water Innovation Technologies project - USAID funded program - JORDAN

Zachary Baquet: Welcome Raed!

Adam Ahmed: Hi Nacasi, we are not having audience members call into this webinar today.

Jonathan Hubchen: Hello, Caitlin

Caitlin Holder: Hey Dr. Hubchen I made it

Julie MacCartee (USAID/BFS): Welcome, everyone! We'll get started in about 3-4 minutes.

Zachary Baquet: If you have not answered the polls to the left please take a moment.

AV Tech: We'll be starting shortly!

Jonathan Hubchen: Can the administrators or anyone else tell me how to remove the poll boxes? I will they turn off at the beginning of the webinar?

Modibo G Coulibaly: I prefer contact

Sarah Huber: Hi, this is Sarah joining from Nigeria

Julie MacCartee (USAID/BFS): The polls will disappear shortly :-)

Kristin Davis: Hi Sarah! Nice to "see" you.

Sarah Huber: You, too! Looking forward to the talk

Eva Christensen: Eva joining from DC

Patrick McBride: This is Patrick McBride with Winrock International

Kaitlin Lesnick: Hi everyone! Kaitlin Lesnick joining from RTI International

Zachary Baquet: Hi Kaitlin! Thanks for joining!

Zachary Baquet: Thanks for joining Eva and Patrick!

Agnes Tumusiime: Hi all. Agnes Tumusiime, M&E practitioner and consultant from Kampala, Uganda

Andrew Cochrane: Hi all. Andrew Cochrane from Illovo Sugar Africa joining from South Africa

Titus Echima Lendi: Titus is waiting patiently From Adjumani, Uganda

Claude Nankam: This is Claude Nankam from Food For The Hungry

Bill Thomas: Good Morning!

Zachary Baquet: Hi Anges and Andrew!

Zachary Baquet: Hey Bill!

Tracy Mitchell: Hi. Also joining from RTI today.

Rebecca Mantel: Good morning! This is Rebecca Mantel from CNFA.

martin fowler: Martin Fowelr, USAID Uganda!

Victoria Dokken: Hello everyone! Morning- joining from BFS

Mark Blackett: Good morning. This is Mark from AMEA

Jonathan Hubchen: Jonathan Hubchen from the Louisiana State University Agricultural Center

Alice Nkuzimana: Hi It is Alice and Christine from Papyrus SA in Haiti

Josephine Assenga: Adam Saffer, CNFA, COP for an agribusiness investment activity in Nigeria

Mekdes Girmaw Bezabih: Hi, this is Mekdes from Digital Green- Ethiopia

David Fischer: Hello -- David Fischer from ACDI/VOCA here

Juliet Simons: Hello. Joining from SCOPEinsight in the Netherlands

Arwen Bailey: Hello. Bioersivity International in Rome, Italy

Michael López: Good morning from COLOMBIA

AV Tech: Our presenters are joining from around the globe (Uganda, Senegal, and South Africa) so please bear with us as we coordinate hand-offs and transitions between segments of the webinar.

Austen Moore: Hello. Joining from the FTF SANE project in Malawi.

John Peters: Hello everyone

Paul Guenette: Congrats to the tech support team for a terrific on-time global webinar launch!!

Caitlin Holder: Caitlin Holder Undergrad at Louisiana State University

Putso Nyathi: Hi Everyone, I am Putso Nyathi from IFAD, joining from Nairobi Kenya

Horacio Rodriguez Vazquez: Horacio Rodríguez Vázquez, Climate & Food Security Coordinator for Latin America @ The Nature Conservancy

Josh Voges: Hi -- Josh Voges from Catholic Relief Services in the US

Zachary Baquet: Thank you Paul!

Alice Uwingabiye :Hi, Alice Uwingabiye from Rwanda, Land O Lakes International Development

Viktoriia Gultai: Hello! Viktoriia Gultai, Agriculture and Rural Development Support project, Ukraine

Sereyrih Ly: Hi, This is Sereyrih Ly from Feed the Future Cambodia Harvest II

Ramatu Al-Hassan: Hello everyone. Joining in from University of Ghana, Accra Ghana

Adolfo Ruiz: Adolfo Ruiz - World Vision, Technical Director for Market System Development

Carl Wahl: Carl Wahl, Concern Worldwide Agriculture Advisor, Crops Production

Abu Yarmah: AYarmah from Food for th Hungry, Washington DC

Abraham Kiboki: A rabam from Kenya is

Kim Hian Seng: Hi, this is Kim Hian Seng from Feed the Future Cambodia Harvest II

Emmanuel Okolie: Hi, Emmanuel Okolie from Nigeria, CNFA Nigeria

Charlin Caster: Hi, Charlin from DC

Carolyn Burns: Hi there! This is Carolyn Burns from MEDA in Toronto, Canada

Adam Ahmed: Charlin!!!

AV Tech: Charlin!

Charlin Caster: Hey Adam!!

Julie MacCartee (USAID/BFS) :Welcome all, and thank you for joining! Looking forward to your questions and comments on the content today.

Charlin Caster: Hey both Adams!

Juliet Simons: @David fisher

Cesar Ramirez: Cesar Ramirez from Mercy Corps Puerto Rico. Hello Everyone!!

Martin Banda 2: Hi Jean-Michel

Catherine Kilelu: Hi there-This is Catherine Kilelu from Kenya

Millie Gadbois: Millie Gadbois: Hello from the MEDA ARNIR project in Senegal

Evan Meyer: HI everyone, checking in here from Jordan

Zachary Baquet:A LL you can download the webinar slides from the left.

Kiza Annet : hi

Zachary Baquet: Hi Evan! Glad you could join us!

Hans Muzoora 2: Hi ? Hans Muzoora from Uganda

Gigi Gatti: Hello from Grameen Foundation, Gigi Gatti

Zachary Baquet: Welcome Kiza and Hans!

Modibo Traore: Hi, I am Modibo from Mali

Juliet Simons 2: Hi everyone, I'm Pablo Mendoza from SCOPEinsight, joining from the Netherlands

Jennifer Park: Jennifer Park from RTI International

Jonathan Hubchen: Is DLEC a successor project to MEAS?

Zachary Baquet: Hi Gigi, Modibo, and Juliet! Thanks for joining!

Charya Khim: Hi everyone, this is Charya from Cambodia Harvest II

Lizzie Jones: Hi, this is Lizzie Jones, CNFA in DC

Claudio Castro: Claudio Castro, from Root Capital. Costa Rica

Modibo G Coulibaly: Hi Zachary

Joan Kimaiyo: hi Joan from Kenya

John Cherek: Hello from SCOPEinsight in Utrecht, The Netherlands

Pascale BONZOM: Hi Pascale Bonzom from UNDP Regional Hub in Panama

Zachary Baquet: Welcome Charya, Lizzie, and Claudio!

Stephen Justin Ecaat: Hi everyone Joining from Farm Radio international -Uganda Office

Abram Bicksler: Hello everyone- Abram Bicksler from FAO; Rome Italy

John Peters: DLEC is USAID's central mechanism to support extension. MEAS was the previous centrally supported mechanism.

Zachary Baquet: Kristin Davis speaking now.

Nicolas Petit: Hi everyone. Nicolas Petit from UNDP Green Commodities Programme

Modibo G Coulibaly: I haven't VOICE

Modibo G Coulibaly: Is it the same for all?

Bonaventure Fandoha: Bonaventure Fandohan from Chicago

Eva Christensen: no, I can hear

Paul Guenette: Sound clear here in DC

Eva Christensen: for voice, check the green mute/speakers button at upper left of screen

Zachary Baquet: @Modibo everyone uses the chatbox to ask questions.

Modibo G Coulibaly: Wtat advice?

Zachary Baquet: We have over 200 attendees today!

Modibo G Coulibaly: advice

AV Tech: Modibo --> bottom right, yellow tab. Private chat from me.

Josephine Assenga: Adam Saffer: Joining from the FTF Agribusiness Investment Activity. Hello to all those friends on the line!!

Julie MacCartee (USAID/BFS): Thanks, John! @Jonathan Hubchen, John Peters answered your question on MEAS: DLEC is USAID's central mechanism to support extension. MEAS was the previous centrally supported mechanism.

Mansouza Kingu: hi Mansouza Kingu from Dar es salaam, Tanzania.

Lilian Nkengla: Hi Everyone, Lilian Nkengla from Oxfam America

Julie MacCartee (USAID/BFS): Welcome and thanks for saying hello! Glad to have a global audience

Zachary Baquet: Hello Mansouza and Lilian! Thanks for joining!

Mansouza Kingu: Representing KinguVille Agro Solutions Limited, any if interested to invest in Tanzania. DO CHECK ME via meccakingu@gmail.com

Gary Alex: There seems to be little information available on the USDA extension service programs and whether they differ from other USAID activities.

Judy Payne: Do you have any sense of # of farmers reached by various approaches? Radio of course is common and effectiv. Any numbers on other digital tools/services?

Brenda Ortiz: Brenda Ortiz - Auburn University Faculty. Current Visiting Scientist at FAO - AGDR unit

Portia Kuffuor: Hi Everyone, Portia Kuffuor from Camfed International

Erna Abidin: Hi everybody, I am from non-profit NGO, ReputedAGRIC4DEV Stichting registered in The Netherlands, working in tropics. Currently, began in Ghana, and soon in Indonesia. We are working on agric innovation for upscaling. Our mission is on food security, improved nutrition, knowledge on combating the climate change effect linked to agricultural systems, and incomes for vulnerable people including youth and women.

Paul Guenette: Public extension, good or bad, largely sets the mood & parameters for market-driven private extension. Isn't public extension, bad or good, a strong determinant of private EAS?

Julie MacCartee (USAID/BFS): Thank you for joining and for sharing!

Julie MacCartee (USAID/BFS): ALL- please feel free to post your questions here any time. We are collecting them and will address as many as we can

Paul Guenette: Bingo! Thnx for addressing public EAS umbrella.

Julie MacCartee (USAID/BFS): Paul, did Kristin's comments on the importance of Public EAS answer your question? Ah yes, thanks for confirming!

Paul Guenette: Producer org EAS should draw from AMEA resources and tools!

Julie MacCartee (USAID/BFS): Paul, what is AMEA?

Gary Alex: On Judie's question on numbers reached by different ICTs - It would be really hard to get at this as reportign vares so widely across projects as to numbers reached by diffetrent extension tools and activities. Things blur as say radion reaches very large numbers but soem of the other ICT tools are pilot activities reaching modest numbers. Lots of variation.

James Obarowski: Hi everyone, joined a few minutes late, I am from TechnoServe leading our Benin programs; we are experimenting with a range of extension approaches including farmer groups, community-based private service providers, outgrower systems for large buyers, and working intensively to develop the Ministry of Agriculture's extension services

Paul Guenette: AMEAGlobal.org a group of implementers developing tools and standards for producer org development and strengthening. Free access!

Julie MacCartee (USAID/BFS): Excellent, thanks, Paul! And thanks for your comments, Gary.

Julie MacCartee (USAID/BFS): Welcome, James!

Bonaventure Fandohan: will you share the Powerpoint after the presentation?

Julie MacCartee (USAID/BFS): Bonaventure - you can download them now in the "File Downloads" box

Bonaventure Fandohan: Thanks

Adam Ahmed: Hi Bonaventure, I will send out a recording of the webinar after the event as well

Julie MacCartee (USAID/BFS): And they will also be shared with you by email once the recording and transcript are ready

Mark Blackett: Thanks Paul. Yes, AMEA (www.ameaglobal.org) has a toolkit developed from its members....many who are on the telcon today

martin fowler: Paul Guenette: Public extension, good or bad, largely sets the mood & parameters for market-driven private extension. Isn't public extension, bad or good, a strong determinant of private EAS? There is so much disagreement on the efficacy of the public extension service over time, that it must be hard for any potential private sector EAS provider to decide whether they should intervene in the country, or not!

Bonaventure Fandohan: Thanks Adam! I appreciate it.

Gordon Otieno Wanzare: How do you assess the strength/weakness of EAS say public or private. Is there a tool for assessing this? Please share

Paul Guenette: Good point Martin. Kristin's Best-fit slide answers our query. Public policy sets umbrella for possible private EAP.

Gary Alex: Some of these issues seem to support the new USAID move to Country Development Cooperation Strategies (CDCSs) that reflect the new emphasis on Journey to Self-Reliance. (J2SR) The streamlined CDCS won't allow a lot of space for analysis of extension, but the focus on local capacity seems relevant.

Adulation Ndlovu: @ martin, well said!!!! and it is a wide perception among smallholder farmers, they perceive public extension as ineffective

Andrew Cochrane: Can DLEC advise and assist private sector EAS design?

Liz Ogutu: Do you have scenario timescales for how long it would take to implement these Best-fit recommendations? Assuming some regionality or shared environment etc?

Paul Guenette: Across Africa farmers face weak public EAS.

Mark Blackett: They also face weak "private sector" EAS as well, especially when it is a supply led approach

Erna Abidin: @Kristin Davis, how are we going to link the USAID program to a non-profit NGO outside of USAID program?

Jonathan Hubchen: How is oversight provided so that private company-based EASs are addressing farmers needs and not their own.

HENRY PHIRI: On emphasizing relevant ICT on strengthen private extension: how does Feed the Future come in to help, in what role?

RAMESH DESHPANDE 2: What about cost of private and public extension services? Any guidelines?

Paul Guenette: Many public sector institutions don't willingly "retreat" from their role in EAS. It's a different dance by country, n'est-ce pas?

john McCormack 2: Have you delineated the role of public and private sector providers, particularly where it relates to public goods services, disease control, information.

RAMESH DESHPANDE 2: Private Extension Services usually provided by input dealers ..could be a conflict of interest situation?

Ramatu Al-Hassan: any differences in quality of service of the two systems?

Modibo Traore: How we can strengthen the Public extension services when you can not have an agreement with the government due to the post coup d'etat

Erna Abidin: with regard to Mr. Paul Guenette, I agree with him, however, it depends on a person who can talk with the team from the public sector.

Liz Ogutu: Thanks Kristin for those answers

Cindy Arnevik: is there a minimum input supplier profits required to build or even assume a public program can be developed and maintained?

Erna Abidin: Ok. thanks, Kristin Davis

Staford Francis Mwambola: How do strengthen both private and public EAS concurrently? I see farmers running for public EAS for they provide free services

AV Tech: Thanks to Robert Anyang for joining us from Uganda

Kristin Davis: Feed the Future countries: Bangladesh, Ethiopia, Ghana, Guatemala, Honduras, Kenya, Mali, Nepal, Niger, Nigeria, Senegal, and Uganda. See

<https://www.usaid.gov/news-information/press-releases/aug-31-2017-administrator-green-announces-next-phase-feed-the-future>

Lilian Nkengla: How do the AES ensure gender integration in their programs?

AV Tech: To expand the presentation, click on the four arrows at the top of the presentation window

Kristin Davis: @Staford, I think we need to sensitize producers to the quality of services. I know people get used to things for free, but often people realize that you get what you pay for. They need to see what the private brings vs. what the public brings. Both have their comparative advantage.

elon Gilbert: In some countries development projects seriously blur the lines between public and private extension with HR moving back and forth complicating the institutional strengthening and sustainability across the board. Lessons from DLEC on this problem?

Carl Wahl 2: Would say the objective of a farmer led model is to convey a message or set of messages, not serve as a long-term extension model.

Angélica Duarte: Cordial saludo

Kiza Annet : im kiiza annet from eastwestseed uganda

Kristin Davis: @Andrew Cochrane, yes, DLEC can advise and assist private sector EAS design in Feed the Future countries and for USAID Missions.

Andrew Cochrane: @Kristin thanks

john McCormack 2: one of the critical issues private sector providers face is their certification and regulation, you rightly point out that public sector provision is important in providing the framework, what is being done to regulate and certify private sector providers as their service delivery needs to be harmonized and aligned with national level parameters on legislation and harmonization of service delivery particularly by private sector providers

Victor Pinga: VAM preceded CPMA as it had already been promoted under the predecessor project, LEAD, I believe

Kristin Davis: @Jonathan Hubchen, see my recommendation #8, this is a role for the public sector or some relevant institution to provide regulation and certification systems. I can share links to such systems in South Africa, Uganda, Philippines.

Aldegunda Matunda: Hello Aldegunda fro Tanzania

Titus Echima Lendi: How can we ensure that the Private sector model reaches to the expected rural farmers who lagging behind due to information gaps between the value chain lines?

Paul Guenette 2: Tablet-based videos are very helpful in EAS in Ghana. Great ICT innovation!

Kristin Davis: @Ramatu, it depends very much on the specific service and how quality is measured, as to differences in quality between public and private. You may have poor or good quality in either; however, public systems tend to be overstretched yet have the human capacity. Private services can be more specialized yet not have good reach.

Judy Payne: Could Kristin or Robert comment a bit on how Robert's VAM approach contrasts with One Acre Fund's approach?

AV Tech: To expand the presentation, click on the four arrows at the top of the presentation window

Kristin Davis: @Staford, I think we need to sensitize producers to the quality of services. I know people get used to things for free, but often people realize that you get what you pay for. They need to see what the private brings vs. what the public brings. Both have their comparative advantage.

elon Gilbert: In some countries development projects seriously blur the lines between public and private extension with HR moving back and forth complicating the institutional strengthening and sustainability across the board. Lessons from DLEC on this problem?

Carl Wahl 2: Would say the objective of a farmer led model is to convey a message or set of messages, not serve as a long-term extension model.

Angélica Duarte: Cordial saludo

Kiza Annet : im kiiza annet from eastwestseed uganda

Kristin Davis: @Andrew Cochrane, yes, DLEC can advise and assist private sector EAS design in Feed the Future countries and for USAID Missions.

Andrew Cochrane: @Kristin thanks

John McCormack 2: one of the critical issues private sector providers face is their certification and regulation, you rightly point out that public sector provision is important in providing the framework, what is being done to regulate and certify private sector providers as their service delivery needs to be harmonized and aligned with national level parameters on legislation and harmonization of service delivery particularly by private sector providers

Victor Pinga: VAM preceded CPMA as it had already been promoted under the predecessor project, LEAD, I believe

Kristin Davis: @Jonathan Hubchen, see my recommendation #8, this is a role for the public sector or some relevant institution to provide regulation and certification systems. I can share links to such systems in South Africa, Uganda, Philippines.

Aldegunda Matunda: Hello Aldegunda from Tanzania

Titus Echima Lendi: How can we ensure that the Private sector model reaches to the expected rural farmers who lagging behind due to information gaps between the value chain lines?

- Paul Guenette 2: Tablet-based videos are very helpful in EAS in Ghana. Great ICT innovation!
- Kristin Davis: @Ramatu, it depends very much on the specific service and how quality is measured, as to differences in quality between public and private. You may have poor or good quality in either; however, public systems tend to be overstretched yet have the human capacity. Private services can be more specialized yet not have good reach.
- Judy Payne: Could Kristin or Robert comment a bit on how Robert's VAM approach contrasts with One Acre Fund's approach?
- Tracy Mitchell: Is there any data on the sustainability of the village agent approach in Uganda after Robert's program ended? If it is more sustainable, this would encourage adoption elsewhere.
- john McCormack 2: Private sector service provision has to be market driven and valued by end user and based on demand for services, donor funded and or ngo funded services generally are not operating in the open market but either under direct or indirect subsidy, sustainability and value of service provision are critical elements to be factored in in the delivery of private sector systems
- Gary Alex: Private extension seems to have the one major gap in that it depends on the incentives to the provider. That is fine as there should be shared value. But this leaves the gap in dissemination of public goods-type innovations and serving clients with limited 'purchasing power'.
- Mark Blackett: What does Robert think of the strategy for Ministry of Ag in Uganda to lead on the VAM model? Does he think this should be a joint initiative with Ministry of Trade, Industry and Cooperatives?

- Liz Ogutu: How do you make sure the farmer is getting good quality inputs and services and the VAM is not working purely for to profit the private sector?
- Kristin Davis: @Modibo, How we can strengh the Public extension services when you can not have an agreement with the government due to the post coup d'etat- in this case I would focus on directly providing services (e.g. through a donor/funder), while strengthening the public capacity. See examples of Liberia and DRC.
- Carl Wahl 2: @Gary Alex excellent point
- Angélica Duarte: how to address rural extension in smallholding areas
- Jonathan Hubchen: Hoe fo you ensure that the VAM promotes improved cultural practices and not just inputs?
- Gary Alex: Also 600,000 farmers applied improve practices. What were the main innovations adopted and how much did they increase profitability?
- Carl Wahl 2: Thanks for the generalization about NGOs
- Janie Dubois: Have you ever measured the capacity to pay by subsistance farmers and how this may help them rise up to commercial capacity?
- Agnes Tumusiime: @Liz Ogutu, thanks for raising the concenr of ensuring farmers receive quality inputs especially in markets where there is a challenge of fake products.

Amanda Fernandez: How do farmers do in terms of profitability using this model of VAs? In other words, we know VAs are making money, but are farmers?

Gordon Otieno Wanzare: What are some of the risks associated with the Village Agents? For instance monopoly in a village? Bias towards some farming families? Trust/miss trust? any other? How did the project handle these risks?

Afia Agyekum: what are some of the behavior change models used in the agriculture sector to support farmers adoption and use of improved agriculture practices? How do you ensure sustainable capacity building and evolving knowledge of the village agent?

Janie Dubois: Who sustains the input stream, updated info and educational materials that the VA sell? Do the VA pay the "central office" for that?

Liz Ogutu: Yes @Agnes Tmusiime

Pamela Robinson: Robert, well-done and thoughtful presentation. Thank you

Amanda Fernandez: And what is the role of the input providers and the ultimate buyers in this VA model? What are they investing to ensure the sustainability of these supply chains?

Paul Guenette 2: How is the VA identified and selected? Is that the govt "certification" program?

Andrew Cochran: @Robert - while the VAM seems effective in getting down to farmers, how do you make the aggregation of inputs and thereby economies of scale more effective in this model. A margin of \$5-6 seems quite high?

Tarisirai Zengeni: Thank you Robert for an insightful presentation. Any learning with regard to ensuring reach to women producers and the extent of women as agents?

Mark Blackett: OK, thanks.....it's a live issue at our AMEA Uganda network meetings

Putso Nyathi: What are the qualities you look for in a village agent?

Agnes Tumusiime: I n what districts in Uganda did the CPM product operate in Uganda @ Robert Anyang? What were some of the innovations realised / success stories in the coffee sector in Uganda?

Amanda Fernandez: By the way, great presentation Robert!

HENRY PHIRI: @Robert Anyang: what do you think is the main way to eliminate peoples mistrust of agents in the VAM model? because as you said mostly people think the agents may want to take advantage of them.

Erna Abidin: We invite all of you to submit the original paper(s) and research to submit to a special issues at <http://www.sciencepublishinggroup.com/specialissue/343008>. We have done careful investigations, this publisher is not a pedator publisher (ref. new list at ResearchGate). Our topics: Effectiveness farmer-to-farmer information sharing dissemination of innovation agric technologies.

Kristin Davis: FYI, Uganda's registration/accreditation of extension info: <https://www.ufaas-ugandacf.org/updates/uganda-launches-guidelines-standards-code-ethics-and-procedures-registration-and>

Emily Romero: @Robert, who sustains the cost of the ICTs and data storage etc in your model?

Rebecca Anzueto: Robert mentioned access to finance as a key element of success for this model to work. How did the project ensure that all of the actors had adequate access to finance?

Curt Reintsma: Excellent discussion--look forward to learning more about how public and private extension can work in complementary fashion to reach more smallholder in an effect way.

HENRY PHIRI: Many thanks @Robert for your response!

Emmanuel Okolie: How do encourage farmers to pay for services of any kind, when there is inadequate access to finance for them?

Emily Romero: thanks!

Evelyn Ifeyinwa Ezeagu: How can we eliminate the Agents? We want sustainable Agriculture to work for the smallholder farmers

Staford Francis Mwambola: How do strengthen both private and public EAS concurrently? I see farmers running for public EAS for they provide free services

AV Tech: Thanks to Jean-Michel for joining us from Senegal!

Kristin Davis: @John McCormack 2 "Have you delineated the role of public and private sector providers, particularly where it relates to public goods services, disease control, information." Not specifically to those levels of details, but see Figure 3 and Table 2 in the full report for different roles based on the characteristics of innovations - public vs. private goods, different providers, etc.

Paul Guenette 2: Thanks Kristin. Many project implementers wrestle with public sector roles in EAS vs private sector EAS. Getting them to work in complementary fashion is the art.

Kristin Davis: @Paul, I'm sure you could give some good cases of how!

Eva Christensen: @Evelyn--Why would you want to eliminate Ag Agents?! It's their role to repair abreast of and share technologies, and to help farmers become and remain sustainable. I think I'm missing your objective--do you mind explaining?

Paul Guenette 2: @Jean-Michel, the irrigated rice transformation in Senegal's Fleuve Region is exemplary. It has helped transform small farmer incomes and food security. Felicitations!

Bill Daniels: no sound

Judy Payne: Are the 5000 "field based agents" the "facilitators" on your slide?

Eva Christensen: lost connection???

Putso Nyathi: no sound

HENRY PHIRI: no sound..

Judy Payne: If anyone can answr my question, that'd be fine.

Paul Guenette 2: He's baaaack. lol

Judy Payne: yep

AV Tech: Jean Michel is joining from Senegal so if we drop him please bear with us.

Evelyn Ifeyinwa Ezeagu: @Eva Christensen, I asked that question based on the trust issue raised.

Kristin Davis: @Staford Francis Mwambola: You ask "How do strengthen both private and public EAS concurrently? I see farmers running for public EAS for they provide free services" I think we need to sensitize producers to the quality of services. I know people get used to things for free, but often people realize that you get what you pay for. They need to see what the private brings vs. what the public brings. Both have their comparative advantage.

Gary Alex: The DLEC report indicates that the vast majority of projects relied on public EAS for support. It seems the reality is that private sector actors are a key client for public extension.

HENRY PHIRI: yea back, thanks @Paul Guenette 2

Eva Christensen: @Evelyn--wouldn't the answer be to improve quality of service instead of eliminating it??

Staford Francis Mwambola: How do you ensure that village agents continue to provide extension post Feed the future support?

Mark Blackett: Is the Farmer Owned Database system available for others to use in ongoing or new projects? Lots of reinventing the wheel that would be nice to avoid.

Evelyn Ifeyinwa Ezeagu: @Eva obviously yes, but more transparent in doing that.

Tracy Mitchell: I think an important element is that each farmer group identified the data to capture in the database and then refined and customized it over time. So there wasn't a single standard.

Julie MacCartee (USAID/BFS): I'm going to paste in a couple of responses from Robert to past questions:

Julie MacCartee (USAID/BFS): Amanda Fernandez: How do farmers do in terms of profitability using this model of VAs? In other words, we know VAs are making money, but are farmers? ROBERT ANYANG: @Yes Apart for yield increment and income the

farmer also benefit from 1. Access to genuine inputs 2. Access to financial services 3. Access to Postharvest services 4. Savings on transportation to buy inputs 5. Savings on transportation to sell produce

Amanda Fernandez: Thanks Robert. What were the average yield and income increments farmers made as a result of participating in this program then? Thanks!

Julie MacCartee (USAID/BFS): Rebecca Anzueto: Robert mentioned access to finance as a key element of success for this model to work. How did the project ensure that all of the actors had adequate access to finance?@Rebecca - But you need to define subsistence farmers . The model is a market approach working with farmers who have surplus to sell and also the service the agents provide are the service which farmers are already hiring their families and neighbors to provide but at a high cost . With innovations and technologies available the agents provide the service 50% cheaper . Also most of the agents do have agreement for farmers to pay at the end of harvest in form of produce or often cash

Jennifer Park: I know Jean Michel touched on it but I'd be more interested in learning how the project broke through barriers to women's participation

Paul Guenette 2: Q: Youth involvement in evolving ag & EAS is key to the "aging farmer" crisis, yes?

Staford Francis Mwambola: What are the incentives for the Networks leaders to continue to maintain their networks after Closeout? Are they paid? Who pay them?

Elbridge Boardman: @jean-michel- could you discuss the data ownership of farmers in more detail? To reach scale, i assume you had high farmer beneficiary targets. How was that achieved while also interacting with famers on a detailed level?

Julie MacCartee (USAID/BFS): Stafford Francis Mwambola: How do you ensure that village agents continue to provide extension post Feed the future support?ROBERT ANYANG: Yes it is self -sustaining because they MAKE MONEY from providing services and that is the motivation and incentives to continue . also the model, village agents can gain potentially full-time employment that can increase their revenues by offering additional services to farmers. Village agents can create a client base for service and agro-inputs provision and can enjoy increased commissions from additional quality and quantity of produce supplied. On a social level, village agents enjoy increased trust and community respect

Kristin Davis: @Paul, yes, everyone's talking about engaging youth, including DLEC! See https://www.agrilinks.org/sites/default/files/dlec_youth_in_extension_and_advisory_services_-_rwanda.pdf

Judy Payne: What did you mean --an example? -- of new performance metrics?

Gary Alex: The two cases seem to be based on putting the farm first - either as the owners of networks in Senegal or havign access to a village agent int he community.

Sarah Huber: How were these farmer organizations so high functioning? Were they selected carefully or was there some significant training provided? Also, how were the bank loans facilitated and what did they cover?

Mark Blackett: Thanks. Would be good to get the documentation so others do not have to go through the same learning curves

Kaitlin Lesnick: @Sarah Huber, re the finance, there are two stories you may be interested in: <https://www.agrilinks.org/post/lets-get-digital-how-new-rice-tracking-system-un-blocking-finance-farmers-senegal>

Kaitlin Lesnick: <https://www.thechicagocouncil.org/blog/global-food-thought/guest-commentary-managing-risk-and-building-resilience-senegal>

Gary Alex: The Senegal experience no doubt benefits from the substantial investments USAID and others have made in the are going back to the 1970s.

Paul Guenette 2: Thnx J-M, great descriptin of farmer org progress, key factors, and gradually evolving motivation/incentives.

Gary Alex: Yes. Thanks to all for excellent presentations.

Paul Guenette 2: Senegal river region also greatly benefited from govt's rural electrification campaign.

Judy Payne: Did you also capitalize on facilitating farmers being able to compare their data -- opening up questions from farmers -- why is that farmer more productive them me? A key aspect of adult learning -- comparing #s.

Julie MacCartee (USAID/BFS): We always appreciate your perspectives, Gary!

Julie MacCartee (USAID/BFS): It's great to see Agrilinks "regulars" on these webinars :-) As well as brand newcomers!

Sarah Huber: Thanks

- Carl Wahl 2: My takeaway from these presentations is that these are all excellent approaches, but with significant caveats (e.g., farmers are enabled to an extent, markets are mainly functioning for inputs and ag. products, etc.) . For the poorer / less enabled, I would suggest looking at building the financial capacity of those using access to local finance mechanisms (such as VSLAs, graduation model, etc.) and later connecting them to EAS (and/or markets
- Andrew Cochrane: @Jean-Michel - is the crop insurance scheme laid out more fully in documentation?
- HENRY PHIRI: @Kristin Davis: On strengthening private sector extension by emphasizing relevant ICT, how does USAID/Feed the Future come in? do they help on procurement or just offering training for extension workers to use those tools. how do you select those that can benefit from this?
- Danilo Saavedra: The group of producer are formal or informal_
- Juliet Simons: This was very engaging: thank you for setting this up. I would encourage others to look at SCOPEinsight's tools for agro input retailers and extension agents (recently published on Agrilinks'blog)
- Erna Abidin: I agree with J-M; farmer org or association is an effective tool for upscaling a program, ex. In Malawi (Mulanke District) on orangee-fleshed sweetpotato adoption
- RAMESH DESHPANDE 2: I think conflict of interest issues have not been addressed!

Judy Payne: Yep -- thx J-M. You also taught me in our conversations that you found it very helpful for farmers to start with basic spreadsheets themselves then learn how to add to their sophisticated use of data.

Andrew Cochrane: @Juliet Simons - can you provide a link?

Ina Schonberg: Do you see differences in extension services for nutrient dense foods (vegetables, eg) compared to staple crops.

Paul Guenette 2: Resource: www.AMEAGlobal.org free tools & advice to strengthen producer orgs.

Ramatu Al-Hassan: USAID should invest in impact assessment at least 5 years after the projects close to assess the sustainability

Paul Guenette 2: Thnx Julie and Agrilinks, presenters were great!

elon Gilbert: thanks Kirsten

Adam Ahmed: Thanks so much for tuning in today everyone!

Agnes Tumusiime: Thanks to the organisers, moderator and presenters. not forgetting the tech team. thanks for the reasources shared too.

Evelyn Ifeyinwa Ezeagu: I joined a bit late, still gained alot. Thanks to all the presenters.

Juliet Simons: @andrew Cochrain<https://www.agrilinks.org/post/success-factors-private-agricultural-extension>

Kristin Davis: thanks everyone!

Judy Payne: I would appreciate future webinars to dig deeper into each of these case studies -- there is so much to think about, learn from these.

Modibo Traore: Thank you the presentation was useful for me.

Andrew Cochrane: @Juliet thanks!

Danilo Saavedra: Thank you Kristin and the presenters

Kristin Davis: @Judy, yes, was saying they need their own webinars!

Gary Alex: In strengthenign both public and private extension perhaps the focus needs to be on support services to extension applicable to both - training programs, communications media, research and technical support.

Juliet Simons: @Andrew Cochraine: with pleasure!

Kristin Davis: Thanks @Gary, good point.

Julie MacCartee (USAID/BFS): Paul Guenette 2: Q: Youth involvement in evolving ag & EAS is key to the "aging farmer" crisis, yes?ROBERT: Yes 100% The model allows youth to participate either as key actors in the value chain (e.g. producers, traders, bulking agents/village agents, etc.) or as village service agents (VSAs) that provide services to farmers, but do not procure produce. The services offered include:• Pre-production services (crop inspection and soil testing)• Production services (inputs supply and pesticide spraying)• Post-harvest services (shelling, threshing, pulping, hulling and drying). The promotion of various labour-saving technologies like mobile maize shellers and electric spray pumps have made agriculture more "cool" and appealing to many rural youths

Henry Kinyua: great webinar...content and presentation

Julie MacCartee (USAID/BFS): Titus Echima Lendi: How can we ensure that the Private sector model reaches to the expected rural farmers who lagging behind due to information gaps between the value chain lines?ROBERT: There must be need for the private sector to work with rural farmers . Private sector needs an efficient supply chain in term of quality quantity and timely delivery of produces . Private sector is willing to work with farmers if they build trust and loyalty . Any investment in terms of information reaching out to rural farmers must be paid back in terms of produce . It is always a win-win situation if they work together

Kristin Davis: @HENRY PHIRI: @Kristin Davis: On strengthening private sector extension by emphasizing relevant ICT, how does USAID/Feed the Future come in? do they help on procurement or just offering training for extension workers to use those tools. how do you select those that can benefit from this? - please see the DLEC activity page on agrilinks linked on the left. DLEC has done work on ICT in extension.

David Fischer: Thanks everyone - this was one of the best webinars recently. Congratulations!

Julie MacCartee (USAID/BFS): Janie Dubois: Have you ever measured the capacity to pay by subsistence farmers and how this may help them rise up to commercial capacity? ROBERT: But you need to define subsistence farmers . The model is a market approach working with farmers who have surplus to sell and also the service the agents provide are the service which farmers are already firing their families and neighbors to provide but at a high cost . With innovations and technologies available the agents provide the service 50% cheaper . Also most of the agents do have agreement for farmers to pay at the end of harvest in form of produce or often cash

Adam Ahmed: Thanks David

Julie MacCartee (USAID/BFS): Thank you David!!

Kristin Davis: @Henry Phiri Robert says Under the Feed the Future Commodity Production and Marketing Activity we worked with an ICT firm @ Akorion to build their capacity to support both public and private sector in accessing the services

Julie MacCartee (USAID/BFS): Thank you all for joining!

Julie MacCartee (USAID/BFS): About to wrap up

Amanda Fernandez: In both cases, I am still trying to figure out how farmers fare financially. Are they making or losing money? Lots of interesting methodologies here but ultimately if farmers are losing money producing these crops, or they are not family sustaining or create a pathway out of poverty, we are not achieving our ultimate objective.

AV Tech: T hanks to everyone for making this a great event!

Jonathan Hubchen: Thank you very much

Juliet Simons: this was great!

Stephen Justin Ecaat: Thanks everyone

Erna Abidin: You are welcome. Good day everybody

Liz Ogutu: Thanks to all the presenters, participants and the Agrilinks team.

Jean de Dieu Mugesera: @Ina Schonberg, yes it can. expecially in develeoping country you wil see that investment for Vegetables is high compared to staple crop like maize, beans, you will further see that providing extension to farmers with less financial capacity is quite challenging and require time for adoption of technologies compared to farmers working in horticulture sector who can by expensive technology easily

HENRY PHIRI: thanks Kristin.

Angélica Duarte: thanks you

Titus Echima Lendi: Thanks every one and Webiner Team

Alice Uwingabiye : thank for interesting presentation

Patrick Rader: Thanks. Interesting webinar.

HENRY PHIRI: Thanks to the presenters and all participants, been great to hear different perspectives on how to approach EAS.

Ina Schonberg: Where actors are trying to make agriculture more nutrition - sensitive - would be interesting to further unpack the challenges and opportunities to promote greater vegetable production, taking seasonality, higher values per hectare, specialized knowledge/markets etc. into account. Thanks for interesting discussion!

AV Tech: Thanks for joining everyone. Audio files, transcripts, and a video of this webinar will be shared out within a week.

AV Tech: See you again online soon!

Josephine Assenga 2: Thank you!