



MODERNIZING EXTENSION AND ADVISORY SERVICES WITH DIVERSE PARTNERS AND ICT

WEBINAR CHAT TRANSCRIPT

NOVEMBER 12, 2014

PRESENTERS

Shaun Ferris, Catholic Relief Services

Andrea Bohn, INGENAES and MEAS

Gretchen Villegas, NCBA CLUSA

CHAT TRANSCRIPT

USAID Agrilinks: Good morning everyone! We will begin at 9:30 AM EST. The webinar room will be open to participants at 9AM EST

maresh Chander: ok!

Andrea Bohn: Hello, a good day to everyone

Rebecca Kisaka: Good day to you..

Andrea Bohn: Yes, I can hear you

USAID Agrilinks: great

Julie MacCartee: Good morning, Andrea!

John Amoakohene: Still waiting. Good day

KDAD AV Tech: Andrea, I'm trying to call your MS Lync Phone, please answer

Andrea Bohn: Not sure what the problem is with the lync phone. Let me unplug and plug in again.

USAID Agrilinks: Good morning John! Where are you joining us from

John Amoakohene: From Ghana

Andrea Bohn: My Lync is restarting

USAID Agrilinks: What organization are you with John?

USAID Agrilinks: What brings you to today's webinar event?

Andrea Bohn: Adam or Mari, die you upload the version I sent last night?

KDAD AV Tech: For anyone presenting, please use the presenter window

Marisol Pierce-Quinonez: Hi Andrea, yes! I uploaded it this AM

John Amoakohene: With The Hunger Project

KDAD AV Tech: When you're able, Andrea, please call 1-312-757-5906 and check the presenter chat for the room code

Arnoldine Stals: very poor reception of sound

Christen malaidza: From Malawi,Min of Agric, currently doing graduate studies at Univ. of

Tsukuba,Japan. My research focus is on Agricultural Innovation Systems and Policy

Christen malaidza: good morning

Lillian Podlog: Good morning! Sound is good.

John Amoakohene: As a facilitator, to participate and upgrade my skills in extension delivery

Arnoldine Stals: I am working in Tanzania for the yes I can hear you

Julie MacCartee: Glad to hear that the sound is working for most!

Arnoldine Stals: I am working CARI competitive Rice Initiative.

Arnoldine Stals: founded by BMGF together with GIZ

James Theuri: yes

Arnoldine Stals: Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation

USAID Agrilinks: great!

mahesh Chander: From Indian Veterinary Research Institute, India

Arnoldine Stals: the goal of the project is to establish business linkages in the Rice value chain and by doing so double the income of smallholder rice farmers in 4 countries. Ghana, Nigeria burkina faso and tanzania

USAID Agrilinks: Sounds fascinating Arnoldine!

USAID Agrilinks: Mahesh, what kinds of projects are you working on at the Veterinary Research Institute?

mahesh Chander: We have developed some interactive CDs on animal diseases, also send messages through mobiles

USAID Agrilinks: thats fascinating! Sounds like some great work including ICT with extension services

Marisol Pierce-Quinonez: cool! Mahesh do you have links available for these?

mahesh Chander: also we have some radio phone in programmes to solve the problems of farmers

mahesh Chander: we developed one information system on organic livestock farming & uploaded it on our website, here is the link
http://ivri.nic.in/division/basic/ee/isof/chapter1/ch1_1.html

Arnoldine Stals: The CARI project is is private sector driven

Arnoldine Stals: And we just started

John Amoakohene: David I can see you are participating

Arnoldine Stals: There is no link to share (yet)

Elon Gilbert: joining from Montana - seriously cold!!

Elon Gilbert: -8

KDAD AV Tech: Yes, that cold front is heading our way. We are not looking forward

Richard Tinsley: Dick Tinsley from frigid colorado

Elon Gilbert: many things including reservation water

Elon Gilbert: big mess

KDAD AV Tech: FYI, we'll start very close to 9:30am EST

KDAD AV Tech: It's remarkable that, in some places, temps have dropped 30 degrees in about 30 minutes

Elon Gilbert: the website is montanawaterstewards - basically advocating for a settlement of very long standing claims by the tribes

Elon Gilbert: <http://www.montanawatercompact.com>

Hava Ganguly: Havaca Ganguly - from Lutheran World Relief which is based in Baltimore but I am based in Austin, Texas

Nathaniel Tablante: Nathaniel Tablante, Extension Poultry Veterinarian, University of Maryland College Park

abir Abul Khoudoud: hi i m abir form lebanon

Hava Ganguly: Morning!

abir Abul Khoudoud: glad to be part of this event

Melanie Chen: Melanie Chen from Freedom fromHunger based in Davis California. We are undertaking to link our women's savings groups to agricultural extension services in West Africa

mahesh Chander: just now my junior colleague came & wanted to know what is this webinar all about!!!a new thing still for many of us in this part

Christen malaidza: Thanks Elton for link

Paul Hixson: joining from Urbana... looking forward to catching up on the latest ICT developments in MEAS

Jeannie Harvey: Hi, Jeannie Harvey, Gender Advisor, USAID/BFS calling from very cold Idaho! abir Abul Khoudoud:i like the topic very much

Andrea Bohn: Paul, we'll not be focussing all that much on ICT per se

abir Abul Khoudoud: i am introducing this to lebanon through a new project

darius mans: Joining from Africare

abir Abul Khoudoud: this friday will be having a metting with all major NGO of lebanon to introduce

Richard Tinsley: Some links of interest from the www.smallholderagriculture.com website: <http://lamar.colostate.edu/~rtinsley/BasicPremise.htm>
<http://lamar.colostate.edu/~rtinsley/Adoptors.htm>
<http://lamar.colostate.edu/~rtinsley/Integration.htm> .

Frederik Oberthür: Hello! Frederik, from GIZ Eschborn here.

abir Abul Khoudoud: we learning it through trying

Norma Minero: Good morning everyone, I'm El Salvador, C.A.

Henry Kamande :Henry joining from Technoserve kenya

abir Abul Khoudoud: iwould like to benefit of this event to actuaaly find answers to our project methodologies

David M. Metsowoda: good afternoon every one, I feel great joining you. hope to have great discussion as well

Richard Tinsley: yes we have exchanged some notes, would like to get a F2F assignment to visit Rwanda

Bob Bush: Hi all. Bob Bush here. Previously with IDE in Zimbabwe/Zambia. did an analysis of their FArm Business Advisor programme in Cambodia. Working as independent consultant about to start looking at AECF financed market linkage projects in Africa

Mark Varner: Hello. Mark Varner coming in from Washington, DC

Ashley Burns-Hassebrook: Good morning! Ashley Burns joining from Lincoln, Nebraska

Philip Huppe: Phil Huppe joining from Cambridge MA

Marisol Pierce-Quinonez: Hi Mark, looking forward to our twitter chat with you tomorrow!

Rebecca Kisaka: Hello, this is Rebecca Kisaka from Farm Concern International

David M. Metsowoda: that is how great it feel saying goodafternoon when others are saying goodmorning

mahesh Chander: does moderanizing means reducing the cost of delivery, speed of communication, replacing face to face contacts??

Hugh Kelly: Good morning. Would love to hear from anyone with experience using mobile phones to create communities of practice around sustainable/regenerative food system design: permezone.org

Usha Venkatachallam: Hello everyone, this is Usha Venkatachallam (Appropriate IT) from Washington DC...

Andrea Bohn: Mahesh, good questions.

Richard Tinsley: As for extensionin general how much of the extension effort is based n knowledge being the limited factor, and is this correct or are farmers more constrained by the operational limits to extend the small plot results across the community

Rebecca Kisaka: We are based in Nairobi, Kenya.

Abigail Price: Hi, This is Abigail Price with Partners for Development, a Washington DC based non-profit.

Jack Hazelwood: Jack hazelwood form Lethbridge, Alberta here. Thank you for this

Sid Mohan: Hello. Sid Mohan with the World Agroforestry Centre

Richard Tinsley: is this Jerod responding to the introductions

Julie MacCartee: Welcome, everyone! A great crowd on the webinar today.

Steve Morris: Hi all, Steve Morris, Global Secure Livelihoods advisor for VSO working from Lusaka. We have quite a lot of smallholder support projects around Africa and Asia. And currently transitioning from our MMW4P project to Increasing Market Access for the Poor for the next 5 years. Very interested in mainstreaming ICT into our approaches with our partners.

Leslie Gardiner :Hi everyone. I am Market-Led Development Advisor for CHF joining you from Ottawa, Canada.

Elijah Mwangi: Hello This is Elijah Mwangi from Farm Concern International

Rupert Best: Good morning! Rupert Best - CRS in Bogotá, Colombia

Peter Hessels: hi, this is peter Hessels from KIT in the Netherlands

Austen Moore: Austen Moore from the MEAS Project

Caitlin Nordehn: Hi, Caitlin Nordehn here from Cultural Practice in Washington, DC.

Terry Tucker: Hello, this is Terry Tucker from Cornell University.

Steven Franzel: Steve Franzel, World Agroforestry Centre (Hi Sid!)

Elizabeth Teague: Good morning, this is Lizzie Teague and Hubert Peri from Root Capital.

abir Abul Khoudoud: good morning

Virginia Bunker: CLUSA International's Sarah Luche Durso and Virginia Bunker are joining

David M. Metsowoda: may I introduce myself, David joining from The Hunger Project Ghana

David Soroko: Hi this is David Soroko from Weidemann/Crown Agents USA

Kristy Cook: Kristy Cook, Cultural Practice, LLC and the INGENAES project

Claudia LaLumia: Claudia LaLumia, Associate at Tetra Tech

abir Abul Khoudoud: hello

David Erickson: Hello, This is David Erickson from ECHO

Len Foan: Hi this is Len Foan, from CRS East and South Asia Region

Melanie Chen: Audio is off?

julie march: Good morning, Julie March from USAID/OFDA

USAID Agrilinks: Hi Melanie-- audio is going

Concetta DiRusso: Concetta DiRusso USAID

Aden Aw-Hassan: Hi Aden Aw-Hassan from ICARDA is here

Katy Heinz: Katy Heinz, Communications with MEAS/INGENAES. Hello everyone!

Kevin Fath: Good Morning! Joining from USAID/BFS in Washington DC

Marisol Pierce-Quinonez: Hi Katy! Look forward to chatting with you later about the INGENAES activity page

Eva Kassara: Hi everyone, this is Eva Kassara, graduate student at Michigan State University (from Tanzania)

Anita Campion: Good morning, Anita Campion from Connexus Corporation (organizer of Cracking the Nut)

Subha Priya Narayanaswamy: Hi Good morning, Subha from Appropriate IT, Washington DC

USAID Agrilinks: Great to see so many people joining this morning, we encourage participant dialogue and questions throughout the presentation

Scott Overdyke: Hi all! - Scott Overdyke from Root Capital - Cambridge, MA

julie march: sound is not good

mahesh Chander: sound is good for me

USAID Agrilinks: Hi Julie, sorry to hear you are having trouble with the sound

Joseph Ndungu: sound is much better now

USAID Agrilinks: Anita, just looked up Cracking the Nut, what an interesting idea!

Julie MacCartee: Hi Julie! Are you joining from Ronald Reagan Building? Sometimes there are issues in that building. We recommend trying a browser OTHER than Chrome for better sound

USAID Agrilinks: if other folks are interested the link is here:
<http://www.crackingthenutconference.com/>

Fernando Manzo Ramos: Hi. Fernando Manzo-Ramos, professor of extension at Colegio de Postgraduados in Mexico.

KDAD AV Tech: Andrea is joining us via speakerphone so the sound won't be quite as clear as our other presenters

USAID Agrilinks: Buen dia Fernando! Un gusto

Elizabeth Dunn: Elizabeth Dunn, Impact LLC, Gainesville Florida

Julie MacCartee: ALL - please feel free to enter your questions at any time. We will collect them and pose them after the presentations

Richard Tinsley: how about facilitaing access to enhanced operational resources such as contract mechanization that will expedite thier ability to utilize the recommendation promoted for thier benefits

USAID Agrilinks: Dr. Tinsley, do you have a question for a presenter oriented towards that topic?

julie march: Yes I am, thanks, Ill try that

Richard Tinsley: How can extension deal with the operational limits farmers have to manage thier land and comply with recommendatios?

Richard Tinsley: maybe government has staff but do they have the operational funds to implement programs

abir Abul Khoudoud: what does basically determine privatization of extension system in a particular country?

mahesh Chander: Modernizing may mean different to different countries-US, Nepal, Somalia for instance at different levels in terms of educational level, farmers capacities & infrastructure

Aden Aw-Hassan: Can private extension systems serve public good

abir Abul Khoudoud: how to empower farmer groupings/organizations to impact extension services

Sid Mohan: Are extension efforts too fragmented? Considering we have the govt, donor projects, private companies etc all trying to push their messages to farmers. Is there a need for a more coordinated approach?

Andrea Bohn: Dear Sid, yes, quite possibly. We'll be talking about this in the conclusions

Aden Aw-Hassan: Who is supporting the capacity of NGOs in extension skills

Sid Mohan: Great. Thanks Andrea. Missed the last part of your presentation.

Steve Morris: VSO is supporting capacity of NGOs, Government and private sector extension provision

USAID Agrilinks: Hi Steve, what is VSO?

Concetta DiRusso: What is the role of government in coordinating extension services?

Steve Morris: We have a good MEAS case study on Women Extension volunteers in Ghana

Eva Kassara: Do those countries (Ethiopia, Malawi, Kenya etc) have plans to build the capacities of the extension workers? In some countries in Africa the extension workers know a little much more than the farmers and some cases the farmers know more than the extension workers.

USAID Agrilinks: Feel free to share a link Steve! We encourage participants to share resources

Steve Morris: VSO is Voluntary Service Overseas but we use local community volunteers as well

abir Abul Khoudoud: what does determine best coordination pattern in best extension services or in other words how can public private partnership PPP improve coordination or services ?

Leslie Gardiner: Andrea - do you know of any examples of successful marketing extension? most of our countries have strong production support but next to no marketing support. thanks.

John Amoakohene :How can government give recognition to NGO extension workers?

Richard Tinsley: When farmers are not complying with recommendations to what extent is this the result of lack of knowledge requiring additional extension education effort, lack of the mean to manage thier land requiring enhancing their access to such things a contract mechanization, or lack of logistics requiring facilitating access to needed inputs?

Jack Hazelwood: Jack Hazelwood: I am going to have to miss the end of the presentation - can you remind me again of how/where I can go to see/hear the presentation? thank you.

Christen malaidza :from your studies, how has ICT and Extension supported strengthening of Farmer Organisations. FOs are generally weak in most SSA countries.

HENRY RWAMUGEMA: Henry Rwamugema, joining from INNOCONSULT, kigali, Rwanda

USAID Agrilinks: Hi Jack, a week after the event-- post-event resources are posted to the agrilinks event page here: <http://agrilinks.org/events/modernizing-extension-and-advisory-services-diverse-partners-and-ict>

mahesh Chander: use of mobile phones for information delivery may be most modern way in a poor country where mobile phones are luxury but in a developed country situation it may be a very absurd appraoch where smart phones are common!

Elon Gilbert: How well areCommunity Knowledge Workers (CKWs) and the likes provding the info listed in Shaun's presentation?

Richard Tinsley: Are we assuming acceptance of extension information is discretionay or are the farmers already ,maxed out with the limited resource being a major drag on the physical potential as high lighted by the extension effort?

Kouadio Amavi: on n'entend rien la

abir Abul Khoudoud: still there is a 5% category missing. isnt it?

Julie MacCartee: Thanks all for your great questions and comments!

Fernando Manzo Ramos: Given the differences in farm resources, size, needs, expectations, strategies, objectives (sell productos to a market or produce for self-consumtion), etc., how can extension serve properly all these different types of farmers using ICTs?

KDAD AV Tech: Leslie, from Andrea: Andrea Bohn: Some NGOs, but public sector extension really struggles with this. There is a wide recognition that this is needed but they don't know how to do it. The SAFE extension curriculum has begun to integrate training in market oriented advisory services, so in the coutnries were SAFE is active there is a cadre of public extension staff that have received training

Richard Tinsley: I like your plantaion fellow please visit my friend from Uganda
<http://lamar.colostate.edu/~rtinsley/BananaTrader.htm>

Andrea Bohn: Extension: there is no "one-size-fits all"

mahesh Chander: private sector extension often is very selective- restricted to a few farmers, few crops havinmg commercial value-export potential for instance, so neglect a lot of farmers

Leslie Gardiner: thanks Andrea. that is helpful.

Richard Tinsley :he travels 2 marthons on his bike to market 100 kg of plantains

John Amoakohene: Cannot hear clearly. Speaker's voice too low

James Theuri: Are Food Hubs (Aggregation Points) a marketing strategy option for farmers?mahesh Chander:pluralism is emerging due to growing realization that one single agency can not cater to the diverse needs of farming community- a mix of extension delivery sources can better cater

abir Abul Khoudoud: but how models could be rplicable or adapted to the different countries ?

David M. Metsowoda: i think linking small holder farmers to market is good and can help the farmer to some extent. the main challenge however is that most farmers in the developing countries especially depend on rain fed agriculture or farming arrangement meaning that almost all ofthem will harvest at the same time leading to gluts. how can we deal with this?

Willem Heemskerk: Good afternoon, Willem Heemskerk from KIT in Mozambique

John Russell: Hi.John Russell with EcoFoodSystems in Bend, Oregon

abir Abul Khoudoud: lost the sound

Marisol Pierce-Quinonez: Good point David - I suppose that's where proper post-harvest storage comes in, so that farmers can sell when markets are in their favor instead of as soon as it is harvested

USAID Agrilinks: I think that is a great point Mari-- would diversifying crops--in terms of seasonality and variety help with this too?

Tom Shaw: Yes, but please note you will need some form of warehouse receipts system to ensure that have at least some of the cash at harvest in order to store until the price improves. Without cash to meet HH needs at harvest the farmers have no choice but to sell at a low price.

Marisol Pierce-Quinonez: Tom, yes! We did a webinar on Warehouse Receipts a few months ago. Link here: <http://agrilinks.org/events/unlocking-smallholder-assets-warehouse-receipts-and-ict>

Andrea Bohn: Info on SAFE:
<https://dl.dropboxusercontent.com/u/15810717/MEAS%20Case%20Studies/MEAS%20HRD%20CS%201%20-%20SAFE%20-%20Jan%202013.pdf>

Richard Tinsley: In Zambia a few years ago your senior local staff mentioned that the only thing that farmers marketed through the CLUSA cooperative was what was needed to repay their loans, and side-sold the rest. Is that correct? what is the ratio of commodities sold through the cooperative to the loan repayments?

Richard Tinsley: It reduces the cost yes, but how much overhead costs are involved and do that consume all the benefits?

Willem Heemskerk: Buy joint services, such as seed and product certification services, is another reason to come together. The principle of being innovative as a cooperative to stay ahead of the pack.

Andrea Bohn: And another paper on SAFE:
<http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTARD/Resources/335807-1330620492317/8478371-1330712129614/Module2-IAP4.pdf>

Sid Mohan: That's because in Zambia, selling illegally across the border in the DRC or Malawi often brings better prices than local markets.

David M. Metsowoda: lost link

Anna Antwi: Hi, I'm Anna from Ghana

Eva Kassara: Contract farming reduces farmers side selling their crops.

Leslie Gardiner: thanks Andrea!

David M. Metsowoda: ok back on line

Julie MacCartee: Does anyone on the webinar have comments/insights into the issue of side-selling, per Richard's comment?

Steve Morris: Which is why so many smallholders are resistant to contracts mahesh Chander: India is one of the finest examples of cooperatives in dairy sector-AMUL model is well known. But now when private dairies are making entries, cooperative dairies are not able to meet the competition. How they can face the competition from private players in dairy sector, how cooperative should retain interest of farmers in cooperatives

Eva Kassara: Contract farming reduce the chances of farmers side selling their crops.

Leslie Gardiner: regarding side-selling, we prepare "value propositions" that are communicated to producers just before harvest - so they understand what they would lose if they side-sell.

John Russell: Shaun or Gretchen: could you discuss the role public sector extension services in cooperative development, strengthening and support? Or are they more or less superfluous in this context?

Sid Mohan: In the town of Mkushi in Zambia, close to the DRC border. approx 6000 tons of maize was "stolen" from the FRA (govt) warehouse last year, and sold illegally across the border

Willem Heemskerk: Farmers practice sideselling if price minus transaction costs in the coop are too low

Steve Morris: There is a huge need for smallholder education on how markets work and who benefits where in the value chain before they understand the value and security to them of contracts vs the insecurity but initial gains of sideselling

USAID Agrilinks: :Wow Sid, that provides great context to the issue

Julie MacCartee: Very interesting comments, all

Eva Kassara: That's why you (NGO, govt ext worker) need to facilitate a market platform where all the buyers come together and farmers decide whom they should have a contract with.

Kristy Cook: Just don't forget gender-based constraints, such as education and literacy, usually greater for women, must be addressed to ensure benefits of these models accrue equitably.

Caroline Fowler: Have the commissions that the agents are receiving been contentious at all? (We've heard in other projects it's been difficult to make the commissions high enough for the agents to survive off of, financially, due to low margins on many input products.)

Steve Morris: Yes Eva I agree

Richard Tinsley: What are the sustainable overhead costs for this model and how does it compare with the competing private value chain?

Kouadio Amavi: @ Eva, in Northern Ghana we have such events

USAID Agrilinks: Kouadio, any links to share?

Rupert Best: Gretchen - do we know how many farmers in developing countries are organized into (functioning) co-ops - are they among the 5% that Shaun mentioned (consistent market sales)? Or do they reach further down the 'pathway'? Do you have a figure on the investment required to build a strongco-op?

Sid Mohan: Eva - contracts are great, but only if they are enforceable by law. mahesh Chander:much of extension service is delivered by public sector in most of developing countries, yet it is well recognized the new players are increasingly influencing the extension services. withincreasingly enabling environment their influence is going to increase further

Kouadio Amavi: one is the pre-season and the other is the pre-harvestso to bring actors to network ahead of the planting/harvest season

abir Abul Khoudoud: what were their number the gov. extension staff Gretchen

Sid Mohan: For those interested in how a "private" company works with farmers to promote conservation farming, tree and animal conservation, check out COMACO from ZAmbia.

Frederik Oberthür: Government-extension as gatekeepers!? How does that fit with 1 extensionist per 1000+ farmers?

John Amoakohene: Financial institutions consider farming as a risky venture and therefore not ready to support smallholder farmers even if they are a cooperative group. How do we overcome this challenge?

Kouadio Amavi: @ John: good point

Andrea Bohn: wait until food prices are so high that society at large sees need to invest in agriculture

Richard Tinsley: Are you increasing or decreasing the labor requirements and is that labor available?

Steve Morris: Thanks Sid - do you have a link for COMACO?

abir Abul Khoudoud: its alla project based example. what if the funds stops or the project comes to an end what about sustainability of efforts and activities?

USAID Agrilinks: Great dialogue folks! just a reminder--please state your organization when typing a question for the presenters

HENRY RWAMUGEMA: Thanks John for raising this challenge..we need a clear path on how to overcome it.

Sid Mohan: Here you go Steve - <http://www.itswild.org/>

Steve Morris: Gr8 Thanks

Kouadio Amavi: @ Andrea: yes but millions of farmers can't just fold up and wait for such a time...in the meantime bad agronomic practices due to lack of fundings to sour the right technologies and inputs equally cripples the soil fertility.

Richard Tinsley: How expensive is an animal draft? this in terms of time and effort and how will that drag down the agronomy?

Tom Shaw: John - we need to have farmers with the skills to reduce their risks and make themselves attractive to the financial institutions. Farmers with group management, financial skills leveraged by financial education, having marketing and business skills, have natural resource management skills, and are innovate Innivation skills, then they become vedry attractive to the financial institutions.

Kristy Cook: I would not call COMACO a private company - it receives a considerable amount of donor funding.It's extension service is intensive and effective, but relatively expensive.

mahesh Chander: <http://www.ivri.nic.in/>

Richard Tinsley: Recently in Ethiopia farmers were spending 4 hrs per day attending to animals leaving a agronoic work day of 4 hrs

Sid Mohan: Financial institutions in SSA borrow funds at a higher cost than what their counterparts in the west do - which explains high interest rates in many countries here. To service those high borrowing rates, they have to look at industries or sectors that can afford to pay high interest rates to them, and ag unfortunately is not one of them.

Andrea Bohn: Kouadio: I was being a bit sarcastic. There is a lot of need for advocacy because society at large is not aware of how dependent they actually are on farmers.

Sid Mohan: Agreed Kristy. That's why I put private in quotes :)

Charles Uphaus: Very broken up, difficult to follow.

abir Abul Khoudoud: Gretchen can you come again with the training percenatge related to buying the product?

Andrea Bohn: And we really need to support ways, without distorting incentives for private sector actors, that small holder subsistence farmers will produce more (and make more money) to avoid major hunger catastrophies.

David M. Metsowoda: I understand the risks are not only associated with the skills of the farmer but also weather dependent agric as happens with most smallholder farmers. so Tom, the problem goes beyond the farmer.

Richard Tinsley: why not jump to contract tractor use instead of animal power

mahesh Chander: In India, over 80% farmers have less than 1 ha land holding- which private service provider would be intersted to cater to these small scale farmers?

Caroline Fowler: Gretchen is speaking about conservation agriculture, so animal power would be preferred

abir Abul Khoudoud: but how can we motivate or convince the producers to come together or to work together? its a real problem in our part of countries

Anita Campion: Interesting example from Uganda, can Gretchen provide more detail on how much the farmer training costs (the embedded part) and is there a concern for building competition by training other farmers to be TSP?

Kouadio Amavi: @ USAID Agrilinks: <http://ghanagrainscouncil.org/index.php/news-alerts/ggc-voice/145-ggc-hosts-3rd-annual-northern-ghana-pre-harvest-forum>

Steve Morris: and animal draught power often fits in between agroforestry planting better

Richard Tinsley: this cooperative model has been promoted for what 30 years now? What percent of them will survive the facilation period fo external support?

David M. Metsowoda: Thanks Mahesh, the challenge is similar here in Ghana, what is the way forward? block farming?

Eva Kassara: If smallholder farmers come together as a group/association although they are having 1ha, private sector or financial institutions can be attracted to invest.

Steve Morris: and animal draught is usually more widely available and owned by less privileged providers

USAID Agrilinks: Mahesh, did you attend the previous webinar presentation: "From Smallholder to shareholder, optimizing private sector engagement for smallholder impact? Might be of interest!
<http://agrilinks.org/events/smallholders-shareholders-optimizing-private-sector-engagement-smallholder-impact>

Andrea Bohn: Eva, right on. And a formal cooperative is one model for group formation, but not the only one.

mahesh Chander: <http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/19685277>

Tom Shaw: David - yes which is where microinsurance comes on both sides once everyone knows the farmers skills are not the risk factor.

Willem Heemskerck: Currently look at pluralist extension systems and information service systems for soil and water conservation in addressing climate change challenges for the WB

John Amoakohene: John from The Hunger Project: Thank you Sid Mohan for your input. The hoe and cutlass farming no matter how attractive the group will be, will still be considered as embarking on a risky business. The commitment of the governments in Africa has to be sought for a real paradigm shift from the current farming systems

Andrea Bohn: A challenge is to have a "glue" that incentivises individuals to continue to be a group.

Tom Shaw: There some very interesting way to package weather index crop insurance being used now and a new platform coming together to bring it to scale.

Richard Tinsley: Be very very careful with the estate mode operation for smallholder areas, this was discredited some 100 years ago in the 'gizeria Sudan

Andrea Bohn: An internal savings and lending group has a good reason to stay together, and the SILC process builds trust, leadership, joint decision making.

abir Abul Khoudoud: so this is the key success story is the 100% insurance

David Soroko: Between 1998 and 2012, 240 USAID value chain development projects, worth \$4.93 billion, include 185 that employed some form of farmgate collective action: coops, farmer groups organizations.

Sid Mohan: Tom - you're right. Check out ACRE (formerly Kilimo Salama) in Kenya

Tom Shaw: Yes know of them Sid

abir Abul Khoudoud: who does a 100% insurance coverage? is it a government subsidy

Willem Heemskerk: In outgrowers'schemes input supply risks can be shared between companies and smallholders or fully insured through the companies

Sid Mohan: The question is - can they go to scale? It'd be great to see the same program work in other parts of the continent

Tom Shaw: Kenya is the lead in African in this type of microinsurance getting to scale with about 250K farmers covered.

Steve Morris: Good q Khoudoud

Willem Heemskerk: Improved seeds mean quality seed of improved varieties

Julie MacCartee: We appreciate learning from the experiences you are sharing - thanks for these interesting comments

Richard Tinsley: in a recent webinar it was mentoned that over 90% of the seed planted was market seed, thus will your seed inputs be sustainable once the facilitation effort ends? Wouldn't it be better to concentrate on composite maize varieties that can drift into the market seed distribution system

Kristy Cook: How many farmers have been involved in Risque Zero - sounds as if it would work on a small scale but how on larger scale?

Frederik Oberthür: One doubt I have when hearing the word 'package' is in relation to its implicit one-size-fits-all philosophy. I was in Paraguay recently where CF failed because the package as a whole was too complex for most farmers. Shouldn't there also be a dialogue in order to adapt the technologies to the farmers' setting and actual needs?

Willem Heemskerk: Integrtaed seed system development is needed addressing different seed systems including formal and informal seed systems www.ISSDseed.org

Kristy Cook: Is there a reference/link for the ECOM coffee example?

Steve Morris: Any further detail on ECOM in coffee in Ghana? A weblink?

USAID Agrilinks: Frederik, are you suggesting that Farmers be more involved in process to better tailor extension services?

Frederik Oberthür: @Agrilinks: yes, or at least offer a basket of options, not one package, so to speak.

USAID Agrilinks: ECOM Coffee: <http://www.ecomtrading.com/en/our-products/coffee/about-ecom-coffee-113.html>

Hava Ganguly: thanks!

Andrea Bohn: If farmers don't have a say in how and what services are provided to them you can expect them to value it and ultimately pay for it

Steve Morris: great

Leslie Gardiner: Shaun - cld we have a link to a resource that describes the business extension support example in Ghana for coffee? Thanks.

James Theuri: Are group insurances available?

Leslie Gardiner: oops! just saw it. thanks.

Hava Ganguly: that link is only to ECOM - if the report is available, that would be great

Willem Heemskerk: see also www.kit.nl on the Business of business services
http://www.kit.nl/sed/publications/?search=business&q_author=0&q_year=0&display=5

David M. Metsowoda: lost link

Tom Shaw: James - what exactly do you mean by group insurance?

Rebecca Kisaka: Can the smallholder farmers be able to get insurance through being members of a cooperative?

Steve Morris: I echo Hava's request

Leslie Gardiner: got it - thanks Willem.

John Russell: It's true that farmers want insurance, but the portfolio risk to lenders in the smallholder sector results in almost none being profitable in the long term. And after the initial flush of enthusiasm, index insurance schemes are proving problematic at best.

James Theuri: can a group of farmers share in the cost of insurance - crop failures, food safety, etc

Tarini Mohan: Can someone please share the other link that was in one of the slides earlier? I missed clicking on it

Tom Shaw: Yes, certainly. We at CRS are working to use savings groups as the platform to attract insurer to deliver to their members.

abir Abul Khoudoud: mobile applications should be developed to answer farmers needs (information and solution like application

USAID Agrilinks: Tarini, the ppt slides are available for download in the pod on the left that says "File Downloads"

Julie MacCartee: Thanks for the great questions. We will pose them to the presenters in a moment. We won't be able to get to all of the questions, but will share them all with the presenters with a request for further input after the webinar

Dina Randrianasolo: what was the business case for insurer in Senegal?

Tarini Mohan: Thank you

James Theuri: thank you, Tom

Tom Shaw: James it is difficult to answer directly as the risk is harder to calculate for a group. It is better to use the group as a way to bulk together premium payments and payout in case of an event. This greatly reduces the management costs, which account for as much as 28% of the premium costs.

Willem Heemskerk: In practice I see a lot of competition for resources instead of good coordination between private, NGO and public services. How to get pluralism in place? Farmer empowerment?

gary alex: Many of these services work with small farmers while donor/NGO projects are there. What are the key needs to change the systems to work better without the on-going external aid. Is it in training technical staff of various agencies? strengthen producer organizations? reform of public policy for extension? or strengthening the private sector actors? (or all of the above?)

Andrea Bohn: Willem, you are taking the words out of my mouth

Tom Shaw: If we can reduce the management cost to 10% or so then microinsurance becomes much more affordable.

abir Abul Khoudoud: will you be willing to visit Lebanon for a support mission to the Lebanese public extension system Shaun and Andrea?

John Russell: Tom, affordability to borrowers is only part of the issue. The greater advantage to lowering lenders' operating costs is to increase profitability in the face of high levels of risk.

Tom Shaw: Exactly why I was mentioning the improved skills of farmers to reduce those risks

Tom Shaw: Pioneer Insurance in the Philippines is real leader in managing the risk to deliver value.

Steve Morris: So who is currently doing a study of all these ICT examples and trying to determine which are effective and scaleable?

abir Abul Khoudoud: we would still need to see cases or stories about value chain / market oriented extension services

Vickie Sigman: Shaun: you mentioned getting rid of "free" services from extension to farmers - there is little research to suggest low resource farmers are either willing or able to pay for services - what justification do you use for promoting fee for service for smallholders?

Willem Heemskerk: Community radio is still one of the most successful ICT actions in many countries such as Mozambique

Sid Mohan: Here's a nice example I came across last year on ICT and value chains <http://ict4dconference.crs.org/assets/day2/Track1/05%20%20Smart%20Value%20Chains%20GIZ%20ict4d%202014-03-10.pdf>

abir Abul Khoudoud: what is third party certification of extension programs

Philip Huppe: How exactly do we phase out free? Any examples?

Andrea Bohn: Abir: I'll look up a link and send it shortly

David Soroko: here is another one on ICTs <http://www.slideshare.net/IntegraLLC/icts-along-the-agriculture-value-chain>

abir Abul Khoudoud: thank yo andrea shaun and gretchen . please consider having another session of webinar

Elon Gilbert: Good presentations, but left me less than optimistic about most small holder in Africa in particular ever making the transition to significant/sustainable VC participation. Maybe in a few places for selected commodities, but it sounds like most of the benefits of these VC activities will mainly benefit the less poor and widen the income gap. Are examples like Ethiopian Ugandan beans widespread enough to say that a significant number of mainly subsistence farmers are making the transition.? Will ICT/lots of info to lots of farmers accomplish this?

gary alex: There is evidence - soem from World Bank work in LAC - that small farmers will pay for services. BUT, there is evidence from Europe that even very commercialized farmers will often pay up to only about 60-70% of ctotal osts of advisory services.

abir Abul Khoudoud: thx david

Tom Shaw: Abir Abul - can you send me your e-mail address and I will take up with Shaun your question about a visit to Lebanon?

Richard Tinsley: One question you need to look at are what are the rational compromises farmers make as they apply recommendations to thier limited resources. particularly as it relates to time of planting and plant populations?

Steve Morris: Great point Elon Gilbert

Andrea Bohn: Abir: CECRA (Certificate for European Consultants in Rural Areas)<http://www.cecra.net/>

abir Abul Khoudoud: thx andrea

Fernando Manzo Ramos: Can we get copies of the presentations, comments and questions of chat participants, and the recording?

Richard Tinsley: the same quations could be asked for the US where the cooperative as been declining for years with the USDA no longer tracking membership or market share with the most recent values now well over a decade old at which time it was a minority

Steve Morris: There'll be a recording on the site later

abir Abul Khoudoud: unfortunately in Lebanon farmer coops are weak

Richard Tinsley: the problem was again overhead cost not being competitive

USAID Agrilinks: Yes Fernando, the presentation recording as well as chat transcripts/audio transcripts will be available in about 1 week on this page: <http://agrilinks.org/events/modernizing-extension-and-advisory-services-diverse-partners-and-ict>

Richard Tinsley: government promoting or imposing!!

abir Abul Khoudoud: what is performance contracting in extension

Fernando Manzo Ramos: Thanks!!!

Frederik Oberthür: Gotta go. Thanks so much!

Austen Moore: Thank you for an excellent presentation!

Steve Morris: For sustainability we need to avoid providing the services ourselves but rather strengthening the capacities among existing service providers

Eva Kassara: Vickie, With a basket full of agricultural innovations out there, farmers know what option suits them best and they are willing to pay e.g a most resource constrained community/village in Tanzania was able to pay approximate US\$3000 in a period of four months to manage a well and a diesel water pump because they needed water so badly in their village. So sometimes I think we think farmers are so poor but actually they can pay to services if they clearly see its importance.

USAID Agrilinks: Great point Steve--- give a man a fish feed him for a day--- teach a man to fish feed him for a lifetime!

Andrea Bohn: Performance contracting: clear expectations of activities and outcomes, tracking against goals. Bonus payments for exceeding expectations. The important thing is that expectations of the service provider are defined by the clients

Richard Tinsley: note the financial management for smallholders is be cash poor while hold all wealth in kind both as crop and animals

Steve Morris: or teach a teacher to teach fishing

Richard Tinsley: i think animals have about \$2.00 /kg live weight

abir Abul Khoudoud: thx andre any references?

USAID Agrilinks: well put steve!

USAID Agrilinks: Question from Christoph Pannhausen: The challenge of political economy of agricultural extension was briefly raised, i.e. the various and sometimes divergent interests and expectations of different stakeholders vis a vis the extension agents. These might not necessarily match with the objective to improve service delivery to the farmers. Do you have methods and approaches to address this political economy aspect of agric extension?

Vickie Sigman: Eva - I agree that under certain conditions low resource farmers will pay for services. I find relatively little research that identifies the conditions. Services that are specific to a farmer - such as spraying, vet services - but paying for the more public information is more difficult in my experience

Steven Franzel: Both Gretchen and Shaun emphasized fees for information and Gretchen talked about embedding costs in costs of inputs or outputs. A big problem with embedding is that farmers find ways to access and use the information but buy inputs or sell outputs from other service providers, who have lower costs in part because they don't provide information or other services. What to do?

Kristy Cook: lost sound

Tom Shaw: Lost sound too

abir Abul Khoudoud: very well said shaun

Kristy Cook: sound back

mahesh Chander: sound is ok

HENRY RWAMUGEMA: Is the cooperatives only model fit for smallholder farmers ? I'm thinking if smallholder farmers if can be in "private farming corporation" and have a greater linkages with private services providers , that model i think can be more efficient and sustainable..i need your response please

Andrea Bohn: Christoph Pannhausen: I doubt there are tools yet to address political economy aspect of Ag extension, other than advocacy and shining the light on the project. Several good publications on political economy issues in ag sector at large: Future Agriculture Consortium: <http://www.future-agricultures.org/>

Andrea Bohn: Correction: I meant to write "problem", not project

Jeannie Harvey: I know MEAS (among others) has dealt with the question of how to integrate women farmers. Can Gretchen talk about how women farmers were involved in the fee program and whether they were part of the service provider program. Thanks

mahesh Chander: In India producer cooperatives are moving towards producer companies to give them more commercial or business orientation

Eva Kassara: Yes Jeannie, especially that women contribute alot in agricultural production in Africa.

Rupert Best: Thanks Agrilinks, Andrea, Shaun and Gretchen - good presentations and chat. Have to go.

USAID Agrilinks: Folks, I will be posting some polls about today's webinar. This DOES NOT signal the end of the webinar! Keep on participating :)

Chin Nobleza: On Gender aspect in Ag Extension - are there experiences or best practices related to implementing gender sensitive Ag extension

Richard Tinsley: but when the majority of your commodities are side-sold around your cooperative what does that say about your bussiness model and its it time to look beyond the cooperative model

KDAD AV Tech: Check out the polls please!

Andrea Bohn:Chin: This may answer some of your questions: Reducing the Gender Gap in Agricultural Extension and Advisory Services - How to Find the Best Fit for Men and Women Farmers (2013),
https://dl.dropboxusercontent.com/u/15810717/Discussion%20Papers/M EAS%20Discussion%20Paper%202%20-%20Gender%20and%20Extension%20-%202013_04_01.pdf

Richard Tinsley: I think a closer look will indicate the side selling is astute business decision on the part of farmers mostly for convenience and cash sale

Chin Nobleza: Thanks Andrea!

Mark Varner: There is no 'vote' button in the Poll box

Marisol Pierce-Quinonez: @Mark - the system registers your vote when you click in to one of the multiple choice options

Suzanne Poland 2: Henry - your question highlights the discussion on tailoring services and arrangements to the farmers contract farming could be the best option for some farmers who are working in high value crop production but maybe not the best option for farmers with less resoruces and producing staple crops. You are so right that one model does not fit all situations,

Mark Varner: Thanks Marisol.

Paul Hixson: You have stressed the importance of 2-way engagement with farmers in both information flow and decision making and also the importance of sustainability.My question is what recent case studies or program examples have shown the most promise in terms of identifying how new ICT tools and methodologies canbecome valuable enablingfactors.And, what are those ICT examples?

mahesh Chander: happy to jon it to listen diverse experiences with clear sound uninterrupted, gr8 experience, thanks!

Richard Tinsley: As you can see i have many reservation on the cooperative model and think thier is more apesement reporting then objective reporting which naturally i have highlighted on one of my webpages as follows:
<http://lamar.colostate.edu/~rtinsley/DeceptiveReporting.html>

Andrea Bohn: Paul: an exciting one is participatory radio, championed by Farm Radio International

USAID Agrilinks: Glad to hear Mahesh :D

Mark Varner: What are the 'top three' cutting edge ICT applications for extension?

Andrea Bohn: And in India there are examples of farmers appreciating having a live person to talk to via phone for a two way communciation. Challenge inmany places is to have the experts who can respond to wide range of questions.

Richard Tinsley: how much of the loan repayment represent confication of crops to pay neighbors loans

Andrea Bohn: Paul: Also, using analytical tools on questions being raised by farmers through SMS or voice to find what are the "trending" issues and come up with better responses over time. Several examples of this in Bangladesh with the new tools mPower is developing

Elon Gilbert: Better coordination among extension players as Shaun notes, but high transaction costs involved in that. Often possible to get people to the table, but not so easy to keep them engaged w/each other long enough to produce positive results - a session examining experiences in the collaboration mode - SSA-CP is one

David Erickson: Thanks, Andrea and presenters -- good sharing around challenges and some of the models that are providing insights into the range of ways to more forward.

mahesh Chander: <http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/19685277>

Julie MacCartee: Thanks David, glad you could join!

mahesh Chander: sorry for link earlier, her eis the right on eon mobile phone services by government in India <http://www.mkisan.gov.in/aboutmkisan.aspx>

Jeannie Harvey: Julie, can you put back up the links to resources?I seem to have lost them.Thanks!

Richard Tinsley: Thank you for the webinar

Philip Huppe: Thanks so much!

Julie MacCartee: Thanks, Richard, for always providing interesting comments and links!

Julie MacCartee: Please download the PowerPoint slides at left

Richard Tinsley: just the unrepentent heritic

Mark Varner: Thanks everyone

USAID Agrilinks: Just a reminder, post-event resources will be available in about a week's time on the agrilinks event page: <http://agrilinks.org/events/modernizing-extension-and-advisory-services-diverse-partners-and-ict>

Jeannie Harvey: Thanks Julie!

KDAD AV Tech: We'll leave the room open for about another 10 minutes so you can download resources

Steve Morris: This presentation was great, looking forward to sharing the recorded version with my many colleagues in VSO country programmes who could not attend

abir Abul Khoudoud: thank you all

Richard Tinsley: but i hope my rovocative comments results in some indepth thinking

Shaun: thanks richard, lots of thinking to do !

Vickie Sigman: Thanks toall.Thought provoking!

Hugh Kelly: Thanks to everyone for many great contributions!

Jeannie Harvey: Thanks all for great presentations!

Andrea Bohn: Jeannie, speak to you in 5 minutes

Andrea Bohn: Thanks!

mahesh Chander: bye

KDAD AV Tech: Twitter chat tomorrow: <http://agrilinks.org/events/askag-youth-agriculture>

Fernando Manzo Ramos: Thank you, very interesting insights!

USAID Agrilinks: What a great chat everyone!

Willem Heemskerk: THank u all

Paul Hixson: Thanks for a great webinar

Maria Hettel: Great webinar as usual!

Maria Hettel: Thankyou!

Julie MacCartee: Thank you all!

Anna Antwi: Hi Broghen

Broghen Aitkin: ha, hi anna....and I missed the presentation will it be posted?

Anna Antwi: where are u

Anna Antwi: I just came around. I wasi a whole day meeting

Julie MacCartee:

THanks for joining, everyone. The presentation recording will be posted on Agrilinks, and will be emailed to you if you joined this webinar

Shaun:

thanks Amdrea